

STAFF REPORT ENV004-15

November 2nd, 2015

Page: 1 File: Pending #:

TO:

GENERAL COMMITTEE

SUBJECT:

RESIDENTIAL MULTI-UNIT WASTE DIVERSION STRATEGY

WARD:

ALL

PREPARED BY AND KEY

CONTACT:

S. BRUNET, BSc., MANAGER OF ENVIRONMENTAL OPERATIONS

Ext. 6140

SUBMITTED BY:

J.F. THOMPSON, P ENG., CMM III IP, PMP, DIRECTOR OF

ENVIRONMENTAL SERVICES Ext. 4802

GENERAL MANAGER

APPROVAL:

R. FORWARD, GENERAL MANAGER OF HISFRASTRUCTURE &

GROWTH MANAGEMENT

CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER APPROVAL:

C. LADD, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

RECOMMENDED MOTION

- That, staff be authorized to implement the provision of a Front End Bin Garbage Collection Service for the Multi-Unit Residential Sector commencing January 1st, 2018, and subject to the satisfaction of the Director of Legal Services, that the Mayor and Clerk be authorized to execute such contract revisions.
- 2. That a phased in approach to the implementation of a municipally provided Front End Bin Garbage Collection service be approved based on the following criteria:
 - Mandatory participation in the Multi-Unit Residential Source Separated Organics (SSO) Program;
 - Mandatory participation in the Multi-Unit Residential Recycling Program;
 - Compliance with a two (2) bag garbage limit every other week per multi-unit residential unit as specified through an approved bin size;
 - For mixed-use properties, mandatory physical separation of residential waste and commercial waste:
 - The use of the curbside collection service in addition to the front end bin collection service be prohibited:
 - Leaf and yard waste not be permitted in front end bins;
 - Household hazardous waste not be permitted in front end bins; and
 - Bulky items and white goods not be permitted.
- 3. That the phased in termination of the Landfill Tipping Fee Exemption Program be approved.
- 4. That there be no provision for a Rebate Program.
- 5. That the Front End Bin Garbage Collection Service be approved to continue to exclude ICI sector waste including the exclusion of ICI waste from mixed use buildings.
- 6. That the Planning Services Department be directed to prepare a Report and schedule a Public Meeting to investigate the desirability of revising the Zoning By-law, and Urban Design Manual as required, to require property owners of new multi-unit residential properties to accommodate full waste management services on site.

STAFF REPORT ENV004-15 November 2nd, 2015

Page: 2 File: Pending #:



7. That the addition of a permanent Waste Reduction Coordinator position for the implementation and maintenance of a Multi-unit Residential Collection Program, effective June 2017, be approved.

PURPOSE & BACKGROUND

Report Overview

- 8. Further to Council Direction 15-G-049, Environmental Services staff have prepared this Staff Report to address the following:
 - "That staff in the Environmental Services Department develop a multi-residential front-end garbage bin tipping service or a rebate for same and report back to General Committee with respect to the preferred plan for implementation, the annualized costs of the plan and the implications associated with implementing such a program as it relates to potential future requests from the Industrial-Commercial-Institutional Sector to be added to the service/rebate".
- 9. The purpose of this Report is to provide members of General Committee with a plan for the implementation, costs and implications associated with developing a municipally provided Multi-Unit Residential Front End Bin Garbage Collection Service.
- 10. The current approved municipal residential garbage collection service level excludes multi-unit residential sector buildings that do not utilize municipal curbside collection services.
- 11. "Multi-Unit Residential" is defined as properties with six or more units as per the Waste Diversion Ontario (WDO) designation, expressed in the annual WDO *Datacall* and for municipal comparator purposes.
- 12. In accordance with the Municipal Act, 2001, property taxes are assessed based on property assessment rather than by services provide/used.
- 13. The pricing obtained through the competitive bid process for FIN 2013-055P was in accordance with Procurement By-law 2013-073 which, by design, yields the best pricing available on the market at the time.
- 14. All responders were invited to bid on pricing for the Multi-Unit Residential Front End Garbage Collection Services in the bid document for FIN 2013-055P for the Collection of Garbage, Recyclable Material, Source Separated Organics & Yard Waste and for the Processing of Source Separated Organics and Processing and Marketing of Recyclable Material.
- 15. Pricing obtained from Progressive Waste Solutions for the provision of multi-unit residential garbage collection services was the lowest of the three costing submissions reviewed by staff during the procurement process associated with FIN 2013-055P. Progressive Waste Solutions' annualized price at that time for the front end collection of multi-unit residential garbage was approximately \$230,000, if undertaken in 2014 and they have since, in accordance with the contract, provided an updated current price of \$255,000 (in 2015 dollars). Initial pricing was based on specifications provided in the 2013 competitive contract tender process.
- 16. Front end waste collection vehicles are specialized trucks that differ from the trucks currently used in the Municipal Curbside Waste Collection Program. Front end waste collection trucks use retractable forks to lift large waste collection bins over the cab of the truck to transfer the contents of the bin into the truck. Front end waste collection is an efficient method of transferring large volumes of waste suitable for multi-unit residential situations however, the collection bins require storage space.

STAFF REPORT ENV004-15 November 2nd, 2015

Page: 3 File: Pending #:

- 17. Detailed costing information obtained from Progressive Waste Solutions regarding multi-unit residential garbage collection cannot be published, however the following specifications contained in RFP 2013-055P are attributed to service related costs:
 - a) Dedicated vehicle for front-end multi-unit residential garbage collection for accountability and performance management purposes (i.e. data collection, audit purposes);
 - b) Unspecified duration of engagement for service requirement which impacts amortization schedules for capital equipment purchases;
 - c) Insurance requirements; and
 - d) Performance Securities.
- Some of the garbage removal and disposal service private contracts that are currently in effect for many multi-unit residential properties were reviewed by staff and these "single page" form contracts establish the level of service (i.e. frequency of collection and bin size), term, cost and price escalation factors. Equipment, insurance and performance securities are not specified and the contractor assumes no liability for property damage. Privately contracted front-end garbage collection vehicles used to service multi-unit residential buildings are not dedicated to the multi-unit residential sector. These vehicles are efficiently routed by the waste haulers to service a variety of industrial, commercial and institutional accounts in a variety of municipalities. As a result, pricing established under private service contracts will differ from the pricing obtained through the public sector process. The multi-unit residential garbage collection service specified in FIN 2013-055P was based on a front-end service where the multi-unit residential establishments supply the bins.
- 19. For the existing developments that currently do not utilize a front end garbage collection service, mostly due to lack of space, it is important to note that within townhouse complexes, many of the developers opted to provide private internal roadway curbside waste pick up. When the developer elects to select the private curbside pickup option they have not been required to provide waste enclosures. As a result, the landowner/condominium corporation pay separately for this private collection service with no adjustment to taxes.
- Currently, when site plans for new developments are proposed with the intention to have private curbside pickup, allocated space for waste enclosures will not be provided. Should the landowner/condominium corporation decide in the future to opt for a municipal collection service, the placement and installation of waste enclosures retroactively becomes problematic as the necessary area to accommodate waste enclosures has been utilized for other purposes (eg. dwelling units; amenity areas; parking; etc.) and subsequently would not be eligible for front end multi-residential service.
- 21. The Province's Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe states that by 2015 and each year after, a minimum 40% of all residential development must be accommodated within the built-up area of the City through intensification. Through intensification, it is anticipated that the City will see an increase in medium and high density multi-unit residential developments.
- 22. Multi-unit residential developments (townhouses) located within a private roadway system are not eligible to receive municipal curbside recycling and garbage collection due to private roadway limitations. These developments are permitted to participate in the City of Barrie recycling program through an onsite depot system utilizing 95 gallon recycling carts provided by the Municipality at no charge. New developments are currently required by the Planning Department to have these recycling carts contained within an approved waste enclosure.

STAFF REPORT ENV004-15 November 2nd, 2015

Page: 4
File:
Pending #:

- 23. Existing developments are similarly required to accommodate all waste receptacles within a City approved enclosure. It is likely that some existing developments have built enclosures outside of the site plan review/approval process that are not in accordance with current City standards, in order to take advantage of the City waste management program. These enclosures could be approved through an administrative approval and would not require an amendment to the site plan agreement if considered acceptable.
- 24. Multi-unit residential developments are also permitted to participate in the Municipal Curbside Collection Program if the waste is set out to the municipally owned roadway on collection day, which would then be captured under the every other week garbage collection schedule.
- 25. Multi-unit residential buildings actively participating in the Municipality's recycling program and adhering to the conditions of the Tipping Fee Exemption Program are eligible upon proper application to receive a tipping fee exemption at Barrie's Landfill for disposal of the garbage. Collection and transport of this garbage proceeds under a private contract (for a fee) between a waste hauler of their choice and the building representatives. Approximately 150 (50%) of the multi-unit residential developments are currently registered in the Multi-Unit Residential Tipping Fee Exemption Program.

ANALYSIS

- 26. As part of an overall Residential Multi-Unit Waste Diversion Strategy, a phased in approach to the implementation of a Multi-Unit Residential Front End Bin Garbage Collection Service is being recommended with the first phase being the implementation of the Multi-Unit Residential Source Separated Organics Pilot Program.
- 27. The implementation of the front end bin service will be based on a variety of identified scenarios that will consider property configurations, existing contracts and willingness to participate in diversion programs.
- 28. Full non-phased implementation (to <u>all</u> multi-residential establishments) would not be feasible as there are multiple unique scenarios that must be addressed individually including those being excluded from the program by specific circumstances.
- 29. Promoting multi-unit residential front end garbage collection as part of the standard waste management service level will have the following positive impacts:
 - a) Address the perceived service level difference with respect to curbside garbage collection between the single family and multi-unit residential sectors;
 - b) Create an opportunity to increase the Municipality's knowledge and understanding of the multi-unit residential waste stream that will assist with ensuring compliance with approved waste disposed at the Landfill Site, ((i.e.) Tipping Fee Exemption Program has demonstrated the occasional noncompliant disposal of commercial waste mixed with residential waste);
 - c) Ability to monitor the effectiveness of waste diversion programs and adjust as required;
 - Represents cost savings to multi-unit residential developments and promotes better curbside aesthetics;
 - e) Could be used to promote Environmental Stewardship in the multi-unit residential sector and achieve better diversion performance; and

STAFF REPORT ENV004-15 November 2nd, 2015

Page: 5 File: Pending #:

- f) Provide the opportunity to proactively plan for the location of waste enclosures at the time of designing the development, rather than retroactively attempting to locate the enclosures in a suitable area after the development has been built.
- 30. Promoting multi-unit residential front end bin garbage collection as part of the standard waste management service level may have the following challenges:
 - a) A negative impact to landfill lifespan would be realized, as servicing additional multiresidential developments that currently do not dispose of their waste at the Barrie Landfill, will increase the amount of waste received and have the impact of shortening the expected Landfill service life;
 - b) Could potentially increase landfill operational costs to manage a higher volume of waste;
 - A lack of competition for this service would occur as currently other haulers also provide this service under Barrie's Landfill Tipping Fee Exemption Program;
 - d) There are additional contractor and staff costs associated with providing this service;
 - e) Currently long term care facilities, nursing homes and multi-unit residential buildings that provide a centralized dining facility are considered part of the ICI (Industrial, Commercial Institutional) sector, and therefore would not be eligible for the service;
 - f) Front end garbage bin sizes will be restricted and diversion program participation mandatory. Without these stipulations, there is a disincentive for the multi-unit residential sector to divert waste from the Landfill; and
 - g) Could cause a concern from Developers who would view allocation of areas for waste enclosures as a loss in the number of potential units that can be realized in the proposed development.
- 31. In order to have a successful multi-unit residential front end bin garbage service, the following criteria must be met:
 - a) Participation in the Multi-Unit Residential Source Separation Organics Program is mandatory;
 - b) Participation in the Multi-unit Residential Recycling Program is mandatory;
 - Leaf and yard waste will not be permitted to be placed in the front end bins;
 - d) Household hazardous waste will not be accepted with the garbage;
 - e) Participants must comply with the current two (2) bag garbage limit per multi-unit residential unit every other week, by not exceeding the dumpster size equivalent to 10 units per one cubic yard bin each week;
 - f) The property may not subsidize garbage collection by using the curbside garbage collection program in addition to the front end bin service;
 - g) Residential waste must not be mixed with commercial waste;
 - h) Bulky items and white goods are not permitted; and

STAFF REPORT ENV004-15 November 2nd, 2015

Page: 6 File: Pending #:

- Zoning restrictions to require that suitable areas for appropriately sized waste enclosures be established and included through site plan approval.
- 32. All multi-unit residential developments are optionally permitted to participate in the City of Barrie Recycling Program through an on-site depot system utilizing 95 gallon recycling carts provided by the municipality at no charge. There are currently a number of multi-unit residential buildings actively participating in the municipality's recycling program.
- 33. The multi-unit residential sector does not currently have access to the Organics Collection Program; therefore they are currently restricted to the equivalent of 2 bags of garbage/unit per week.
- 34. A 16 month Multi-Unit Residential Organics Collection Program Pilot consisting of 10 buildings and one townhouse complex is scheduled to commence in QTR IV 2015. With the implementation of a full Multi-Unit Residential Organics Program in the future, the 2 bag/unit limit every week will be reduced to 2 bags/unit every other week resulting in a reduction in bin size or collection frequency. This will create parity with the services provided for the single family residential sector.
- 35. Currently, the Zoning By-law requires that, where private curbside pickup is not the preferred method of waste removal, all multi-residential properties contain their waste materials inside a waste enclosure or in an enclosed garbage facility. The property owner is therefore responsible for all costs associated with building and maintaining the waste enclosure. In the case of block/townhouse developments, waste material is typically the responsibility of the individual unit owner and is placed curb side in front of the unit and picked up by their private hauler.
- Each property requesting to be part of the municipally provided Multi-Unit Residential Front End Bin Garbage Collection Service would be required to undergo a site visit by staff to determine the eligibility of the property based on waste enclosure specifications, diversion program participation and property details.
- 37. Environmental Operations staff conducted surveys of the multi-unit residential sector to determine current garbage collection arrangements and service levels. The information provided by a 20% response rate (64 surveys) complimented our existing program database to yield the following:
 - a) There are 291 known multi-unit residential properties comprised of some 11,000 units within the City of Barrie.
 - b) Currently 184 (63%) of these properties utilize front end bin garbage collection services.
 - c) Of these 184 properties, approximately 121(66%) utilize Progressive Waste Solutions as a private hauler and could be transitioned to a municipally provided service, with minimal interruption. Approximately 25 (14%) utilize a private hauler; transition would depend on the willingness of the property owner to terminate any existing contracts. Transitioning these properties could represent Phase 1 of an implemented service. These represent the properties that already participate in our Tipping Fee Exemption Program.
 - d) Of these 184 properties, 38 (20%) do not participate in our Tipping Fee Exemption Program. 15 (8%) of these properties utilize Progressive and 23 (13%) utilize other private haulers. Transition would depend on compliance with program criteria and willingness of the property owner to terminate any existing contracts. This could represent Phase 2 of an implemented service.

STAFF REPORT ENV004-15

November 2nd, 2015

Page: 7 File: Pending #:

- 38. There are approximately 107 known multi-residential properties that do not have front end bin service and do not meet criteria for the service and therefore would not be affected by this potential service change.
- 39. Survey results have indicated that a number of multi-unit residential properties currently do not comply with Zoning By-laws requiring them to place all waste containers inside an enclosure. To take advantage of the City program, these properties would be required to build or expand existing enclosures, subject to them being able to accommodate front end garbage bins, 95 gallon recycling carts and organics collection carts. There is a potential that the size of landscaped areas, and/or the number of parking spaces could be reduced or eliminated in order to create sufficient space for the enclosure(s). Suitable locations on site for an enclosure would be determined though discussions with the property owner/condominium corporation and City staff which would be coordinated through the Planning Services Department.

Rebate Implications

- 40. City of Barrie staff were requested to consider providing a rebate for the cost of private waste collection for multi-unit residential buildings that do not or are not eligible to use the city curbside garbage collection service. This was an option to address the issue raised by condo owners that pay for the service in their municipal property taxes and also pay for private collection in their building fees. Inquiries with other municipalities resulted in many strongly recommending against a rebate program as it's a disincentive to divert waste, creates an ability for those properties that do enter into the program to cancel out and the administration of a program is workload intensive.
- 41. A full rebate program would cost the city approximately \$325K per year and over the next ten years would total approximately \$3.25M. These costs include the time and material costs for the administration and issuance of the rebates as well as handling associated customer inquiries.
- 42. Setting a precedent for rebates for curbside garbage collection for multi-unit residential units opens up the opportunity for residents and groups to request rebates on other City services they do not receive or chose not to utilize (for example, private road maintenance, recreation and transit services, etc).

Multi-Unit Residential Properties That Currently Receive Front End Garbage Collection Service

- 43. The properties that have front end bin service with Progressive Waste Solutions that comply with the criteria and have an approved enclosure could be transitioned to a municipally provided Front End Bin Garbage Collection Service.
- 44. In order to assist with this transition, site visits would be required to confirm compliance with criteria and enclosure requirements.
- 45. Properties that currently do not comply with enclosure requirements could work with the Planning Services Department in an effort to find a suitable location on site for an enclosure. Some properties may not have adequate space for an enclosure, and others, depending on the size of the required enclosure, may result in reduced landscaped or parking spaces. A Building Permit may be required.
- 46. The properties that have front end bins but do not meet the criteria of the front end bin garbage service would require a collaborative approach between the City and property owner to assist in achieving the requirements, if front end service by the city is to be extended to them.
- 47. The properties that have front end bins but utilize private waste haulers other than Progressive Waste Solutions would be required to terminate their current waste collection contract before being captured under a municipally provided service.

STAFF REPORT ENV004-15 November 2nd, 2015

Page: 8
File:
Pending #:

48. Of the surveyed properties, some indicated they would not be willing to pay a penalty to terminate their contract. Therefore, they would have to be phased into the municipally provided service after their contract term is completed. An estimated transition period of two years may be required to transition these properties to a municipally provided front end bin garbage service.

Multi-Unit Residential Properties without Front End Bin Service on Private Roadways

- 49. There are 47 known properties of the 107 known multi-residential properties that do not have front end bin service and do not meet criteria for the service and therefore would not be affected by this potential service change, which are currently using a private curbside service and are not receiving a front end garbage bin service.
- 50. Some of these properties are currently not eligible to receive municipal curbside recycling and garbage collection due to private roadway limitations. These properties utilize a private collection service in which they receive curbside garbage and recycling collection for a fee within the complex or private roadway system. In addition to private roadway limitations, the majority of these properties may not be adequately configured to have space for an approved waste enclosure. Those wishing to participate in the City program would have to work with City staff in locating a suitable location on site for an enclosure that would be built at the owner's expense prior to participating in the City waste collection program. Should reductions in landscaped open space or parking spaces or any other required element of the Zoning By-law be necessitated, approval through a Minor Variance Application would be required.
- 51. Private roadway limitations would need to be reviewed as a joint effort by the City, Property owner, and Collection Contractor to determine feasibility for providing a front end bin service. Where service is not feasible properties will not be eligible for this service.
- 52. In addition, to receiving a front end bin service, these properties would be required to build or expand existing enclosures, subject to Planning Department approval, to accommodate front end garbage bins, 95 gallon recycling carts and potentially organics collection carts.
- 53. If it is deemed that there is not adequate space to erect a waste enclosure in accordance with the City's Zoning By-law, specific properties will not be eligible for this service.
- 54. If it is deemed by the Planning Department that there is adequate space to erect a waste enclosure and the collection contractor determines feasibility for providing a front end bin service, specific properties may still choose to provide and pay for a curbside waste collection service through a private hauler. These properties would be considered ineligible for a municipal front end bin service.

Multi-Unit Residential Properties using Municipal Curbside Collection

- 55. There are multi-unit residential properties that utilize municipal curbside garbage and recycling collection. It is expected that through phased in implementation of a front end bin service staff will be contacted by properties interested in converting to a front end bin garbage service.
- 56. Properties currently utilizing municipal curbside garbage and recycling services could be considered for a municipally provided front end bin garbage service provided they undergo a site visit by staff to determine the eligibility of the property based on waste enclosure specifications, diversion program participation and property details.
- 57. There are some known properties interested in a front end garbage service but do not meet the waste enclosure requirements. If it is deemed by the Planning Department that there is adequate space, these properties would be required to build waste enclosures in accordance with the Zoning By-law, to accommodate front end garbage bins, 95 gallon recycling carts and organics

The City of

STAFF REPORT ENV004-15

November 2nd, 2015

Page: 9 File: Pending #:

collection carts in order to be eligible for a front end bin program. Properties that cannot/choose not to comply with the waste enclosure requirements could still utilize municipal curbside garbage and recycling service.

- 58. With the implementation of a municipal multi-unit residential front end bin garbage collection service, the current Multi-Unit Residential Landfill Tipping Fee Exemption Program would be phased out according to private hauler contracts and eventually all multi-unit residential developments that can accommodate front end bins would be required to utilize Progressive Waste Solutions under contract to the City of Barrie for front end garbage service.
- 59. In order to eliminate the creation of further exceptions and to encourage diversion, changes to the Zoning By-law and site plan guidelines could be made so that all future multi-residential developments are designed with sufficient allocated space for waste enclosures that are large enough to accommodate all waste streams including a front end garbage bin, 95 gallon recycling carts and organics carts and which are accessible by waste collection vehicles.
- 60. Revisions to the Zoning By-law could be undertaken so that all multi residential plans are designed at the outset to accommodate full waste management services on site. New developments would then be required to conform to the revised standards in order to accommodate waste enclosures.
- 61. "Mixed use" buildings and complexes with commercial and residential units will be required to demonstrate that residential and commercial waste is not combined in the same containers to ensure eligibility for the multi-unit residential front end garbage service. Waste enclosures would have to be designed and built to provide segregated areas for each sector to ensure commercial operators do not have access to the residential bins. This may require a separate enclosure for both the commercial and residential waste. The provision of additional enclosures for new developments may have an additional impact on the amount of land available for landscaped/amenity areas, parking stalls or the number of units that may be permitted.

ICI Sector Implementation Impacts

- 62. The Industrial Commercial Institutional (ICI) sector should not be eligible to receive the municipal front end bin garbage service as this could represent a large volume of waste that the Barrie Landfill is not currently receiving. This includes ICI wastes from mixed use buildings.
- 63. Regulating waste from mixed use buildings that do not separate their wastes would be difficult as already proven through existing contamination seen through the Tipping Fee Exemption Program.
- 64. Providing a municipal ICI front end garbage service would impact local waste haulers who currently provide this service for a fee as this represents their core business.
- 65. Because of the nature and variety of wastes generated in this sector, collecting and receiving ICI waste could increase the risk of receiving hazardous waste at Barrie's Landfill which could have an impact on landfill operations and the regulations associated with the Barrie Landfill's legislated Environmental Compliance Approval (ECA).
- 66. Accepting commercial waste under this program could have a negative impact on Landfill space and result in a closure date much earlier than the anticipated 2035. Current ICI diversion program restrictions would promote the inclusion of divertible materials in the garbage stream, further impacting landfill space.
- 67. If this front end garbage service were extended to the commercial sector, there would be a loss of landfill revenue from the local businesses that dispose of waste at Barrie's Landfill at the current tipping fee.

The City of

STAFF REPORT ENV004-15

November 2nd, 2015

Page: 10 File: Pending #:

- 68. Providing a front end bin garbage service to the ICI sector would amount to a business waste subsidy.
- 69. Current pricing provided by Progressive Waste Solutions is for multi-residential waste only. Costs associated with a commercial service would have to be solicited through a competitive bid process.
- 70. Although not recommended, if there were to be a rebate, it could only apply to property owners and it would be the responsibility of these owners to notify their tenants of such. Hence, if the City were to offer a rebate, city staff could not ensure that savings realized through this program were passed along to the tenants of multi-unit residential properties.

ENVIRONMENTAL MATTERS

- 71. The following environmental matters have been considered in the development of the recommendation:
 - a) Under the current Multi-Unit Residential Landfill Tipping Fee Exemption Program, multiresidential developments are motivated to participate in the municipal recycling program and reduce the garbage generated within their complex because of private hauler fees associated with bin rental and waste hauling. The transition to a model where the municipality provides and pays for front end garbage collection services for the multiresidential sector or provides a rebate for properties where a front end bin cannot be accommodated, will require rigorous enforcement to ensure that multi-residential developments participate, to the satisfaction of established criteria, in all the municipal diversion program options available to them.
 - b) Accepting commercial waste under a municipally provided front end bin garbage service would have a negative impact on landfill space and result in a closure date much earlier than the anticipated 2035.
 - C) Introducing a municipally provided front end bin garbage service could improve Environmental Stewardship for the multi residential sector providing the municipality could leverage the service as a condition of enforcing mandatory diversion program participation.

ALTERNATIVES

72. The following alternatives are available for consideration by General Committee:

Alternative #1	General Committee could maintain the existing Multi-Unit Residential Landfill Tipping Fee Exemption Program and not implement a Municipal Multi-unit Residential Front End Bin Waste Collection Service (i.e. Status Quo).
	This alternative is not recommended as it does not provide an opportunity for the municipality to effectively manage this residential waste stream sector and it would not address the multi-unit residential sector's concerns regarding lack of parity with the single family sector for waste collection services.



STAFF REPORT ENV004-15

November 2nd, 2015

Page: 11 File: Pending #:

Alternative #2	General Committee could decide to discontinue the Multi-Unit Residential Landfill Tipping Fee Exemption program and not implement a Multi-Unit Residential Front End Bin Waste Collection Service.		
	This alternative is not recommended as multi-residential developments could seek private haulers for all waste management services including their diversion programs and waste disposal. This would likely result in the removal of associated wastes from the municipal waste management system and a corresponding reduction in Barrie's diversion programs, the control over important performance data and the municipal waste diversion rate and associated Waste Diversion Ontario funding.		
Alternative #3	General Committee could decide to implement a Multi-Unit Residential Front End Bin Waste Collection Service, but not require the Planning Department to make revisions to the Zoning By-law requiring that all new multi-unit residential developments accommodate full waste management services on site.		
	This alternative is not recommended. Already, there are existing developments that do not meet zoning requirements to have their waste contained within an enclosure or have not been adequately configured to allow for a waste enclosure. This has resulted in an inability to retroactively provide a front end bin service to these existing developments. Without changes to the Zoning By-law, future developments would continue this trend, resulting in ongoing requests for rebates in lieu of the regulated municipally provided service.		

FINANCIAL

- 73. The motion outlined in paragraph 1, concerning the implementation of Multi-Unit Residential Front End Garbage Collection in 2018, will add approximately \$128,000 to the 2018 operating budget in collection costs. The total cost of this garbage collection costs if fully implemented will increase the operating budget by as much as \$255,000 using the 2015 year estimates and additional CPI annual increases as per the collection contract.
- 74. The administration of a Multi-Unit Residential Sector Program would require a dedicated staff member to oversee, transition, and manage the program. The employee costs for a permanent Waste Reduction Coordinator starting in Q2 2017 is \$58,826. The annualized cost of this position in 2018 would be \$89,560. The permanent position would take over responsibility of all waste and diversion program services related to the multi-unit residential sector.
- 75. A vehicle is required for this position as regular site visits to the properties are required and there is no excess capacity of existing Environmental Operations vehicles. A small SUV is estimated at \$25,000 to purchase in 2017 with an annual fuel and maintenance operating cost of \$350.

LINKAGE TO 2014- 2018 COUNCIL STRATEGIC PLAN

- 76. The recommendations included in this Staff Report support the following goals identified in the 2014-2018 City Council Strategic Plan:
 - Х Vibrant Business Community



STAFF REPORT ENV004-15 November 2nd, 2015

Page: 12 File: Pending #:

77. The introduction of a multi-residential front end bin service promotes Barrie's strengths in Environmental Stewardship as a multi-residential front end bin service that requires mandatory participation in both recycling and organics diversion programs will positively impact the City's waste diversion rate.



STAFF REPORT ENV004-15

November 2nd, 2015

Page: 13 File: Pending #:

APPENDIX "A"



ENVIRONMENTAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT ENVIRONMENTAL OPERATIONS

	City of Barrie Multi-Residential Waste Collection Survey
Municipal Address:	
Property Manager/Build	ling Manager:
Phone number:	
E-mail:	
Current Property State	us:
Progressive Exempt	
hand picked	
Other hauler exempt	
Front end bin	
Hand picked	
Private hauler not exen	npt
Front end bin	
 Hand picked 	
Municinal curhside	

City of Barrie staff has been asked to investigate the feasibility of providing a Municipal Front End Garbage Bin service to new and existing Multi-residential properties consisting of 6 or more units.

1. How many units does your property have?

Curbside collection

- 2. What is the size of your bin currently used at your property and what is the frequency of collection?
- 3. What is the length of the contract? Does it include recycling collection?
- 4. Would you be willing to terminate your existing contract and possibly even pay an early termination fee in order to participate in a municipal front end garbage bin service?
- 5. If you are willing to meet/ should your property meet all requirements necessary to receive a municipal waste service, would you be well positioned to receive this service starting January 1st 2016?
- 6. The city currently provides front end garbage bin service to multi-residential buildings providing that they participate in our blue and grey box recycling programs. Would you be willing to participate in our recycling programs as a mandatory requirement to receive a municipal front end bin service?
- 7. As a current planning requirement, multi-residential properties must have a Planning Department approved waste enclosure in order to receive city front end waste collection. Does your property have an existing waste enclosure?

STAFF REPORT ENV004-15

November 2nd, 2015

Page: 14 File: Pending #:

- 8. Would you be willing to provide a centralized front end garbage bin on site to receive this municipally provided service if the collection truck could safely access the property and tip the bin?
- 9. (If properties choose to stay with private haulers/do not want to participate in recycling program) If developed as a standard level of service, it will be a requirement for properties that choose not to participate in the municipal front end garbage bin service to waive their rights to municipal waste collection, acknowledging that you will not be entitled to municipal garbage and recycling collection. You will be required to pay for private collection with no eligibility for a rebate. Do you understand this requirement?
- 10. Would you be willing to participate in a multi-residential organics program?



STAFF REPORT ENV004-15 November 2nd, 2015

Page: 15 File: Pending #:

APPENDIX "B"

SWOT Analysis

STRENGTHS	WEAKNESSES	OPPORTUNITITES	THREATS
Control of waste / recycling streams and consistent level of service, more enforceable bag limits Cost savings to property owners Better curb appeal	 Bins become a target for illegal dumping Difficult to get ahold of property owners; communication is difficult Properties are not willing to terminate existing contracts early Property owners lose control of preferred services (i.e. time and date of waste collection) Increased waste tonnages coming to landfill In order to accommodate the necessary waste enclosures other elements (i.e. landscaped open space; amenity areas; parking stalls; number of units; etc.) may be impacted. 	 Reduce level of complaints from multiresidential sector Divert more waste, as mandatory participation in recycling and organics would limit bin sizes Once the program is implemented, the buildings we have limited information on could contact us to receive service 	 Some properties have unique scenarios; new developments could want the same leniency as grandfathered properties Bins become a target for illegal dumping