

TO: Mayor J. Lehman and Members of General Committee

FROM: R. W. McArthur, P. Eng., Director of Engineering

NOTED: R. J. Forward, MBA, M.Sc., P. Eng., General Manager of Infrastructure, Development & Culture  
Carla Ladd, Chief Administrative Officer

RE: Additional Information – Staff Report ENG008-12 Parking Strategy and Rate Review

DATE: April 30, 2012

The purpose of this memorandum is to provide additional information to members of General Committee further to the meeting of April 23, 2012 and subsequently regarding Staff Report ENG008-12. All projected revenues outlined below are estimates only.

a) **Parkade Monthly Permits**

Increasing the monthly Parkade permit fee earlier (July 2012-\$80, 2014-\$85, & 2016-\$90) will generate an additional \$10,000 per year in 2014-2015, \$20,000 in 2016, and \$10,000 per year from 2017 to 2021.

b) **Deletion of extended hours of paid operation**

The deletion of extending the hours of paid operation will reduce the projected annual revenue collected by \$822,000.

c) **Removal of December Free Parking (with the exception of on-street parking for a maximum of 2 hours)**

The removal of free parking in the downtown in the month of December will generate an annual revenue of \$50,000.

The free on-street parking in December for a maximum of 2 hours is difficult to quantify. Enforcement will be a challenge.

d) **Increase the rate for the paid Waterfront model (Original - \$2/hr, \$10 daily max, Amendment- \$3/hr, \$15 daily max) – Commencing April 2015**

Staff projected that the impact of increasing the rates will generate additional annual revenue of approximately \$100,000. Some of the major factors influencing the increase in revenue are:

- A higher number of visitors will be more likely to park for free in one of our downtown lots and walk to the waterfront in the evening or on weekends.
- Since the average duration of residents at the waterfront is less than 1 hour, the original model assumed that not all residents would acquire a permit, and would just pay the \$2/hr.

e) **Proceeds from the Disposition of Parking Lot Sales**

- i) Questions arose during General Committee's discussions about the potential to use the proceeds from the sale of parking lots to either fund Parking operations or, possibly, other related development initiatives that would encourage downtown revitalization efforts and, indirectly at least, encourage greater use of the City's parking lot inventory. The potential to create a "Redevelopment Initiatives Reserve" requires more analysis, but staff will examine

this further and provide a recommendation to Council as part of a future report. Currently, proceeds from the sale of parking lots are applied to either the Tax Capital Reserve or the Parking Reserve (where the property was purchased or environment cleanup costs were paid for from the parking reserve). However, Council could decide to apply funds from the sale of lands only to the Parking Reserve.

- ii) As part of the Parking Strategy and Rate Review staff had undertaken the process of ranking the development potential for our current inventory of parking lots (See appendix "A"). The reduction of supply has already been taken into account under the previous modeling. The sale of these lands were included in the previous financial modeling and assumed approximately \$2M could be recognized.
- iii) Below is a list of the potential lots that could be sold for development purposes. Staff assigned a potential value and the year that the City could potentially see the financial contribution from a developer. Staff included these in the revised Long Range Financial Plan (see Appendix "B") to provide Council with a visual representation of the Parking Reserve over the next 20 years. The sale of lots may help with short-term cash flow issues but it does not address the financial sustainability issue relating to the Parking Reserve.

	Potential Year	Potential Sale Price	Comments
<b>Mary St. Lot</b>	<b>2023</b>	<b>\$ 290,000</b>	
<b>Maple &amp; Dunlop Lot</b>	<b>2023</b>	<b>\$ 275,000</b>	
<b>Maple Ave. Lot</b>	<b>2023</b>	<b>\$ 336,000</b>	
<b>Maple &amp; Ross Lot</b>	<b>2023</b>	<b>\$ 301,000</b>	
<b>Mulcaster St. Lot</b>	<b>2023</b>	<b>\$ 672,000</b>	
<b>Library (H-Block) Lot</b>	<b>2023</b>	<b>\$ 5,669,000</b>	
<b>Owen St Lot</b>	<b>2020</b>	<b>\$ 850,000</b>	
<b>Bradford St. Lot</b>	<b>2021</b>	<b>\$ 350,000</b>	
<b>1-15 Bayfield St. Lot</b>	<b>2017</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>Assumes there will be a significant cost to clean up the site</b>
<b>Clapperton St. Lot</b>	<b>2016</b>	<b>\$ 203,000</b>	<b>per motion 11-G-303</b>
<b>Simcoe St. Lot</b>	<b>2017</b>	<b>\$ 1,500,000</b>	
<b>23 Collier St Lot</b>	<b>2016</b>	<b>\$ 329,000</b>	
<b>Market Square Lot</b>	<b>2012</b>	<b>\$ 500,000</b>	<b>Would require a council motion to allocate to the Parking Reserve</b>
<b>Total</b>		<b>\$ 11,275,000</b>	

Note 1: Selling some of these lots (ie H-Block) could create significant logistical issues requiring new or altered parking arrangements.

Note 2: The sale price and the year of sale are estimated.

f) **Potential Change in Hourly Rates**

In the event that hourly rates at parking meters/pay and display machines are reconsidered, an adjustment of the daily maximum parking charge should also be considered.

**g) Potential Operational Savings from Lots that can be Closed in the Winter Months**

The following under utilized lots could be closed during the winter months and would generate net operational savings of approximately \$10,000 per year.

Parking Lot Name	# Stalls
North Marina Lot (gravel)	50
Lakeshore Lot (gravel)	56
15 Bayfield Street Lot (gravel)	45

**h) Funding of Parking Services' Annual Operating Deficits**

Members of General Committee inquired about options for funding potential annual parking operating deficits, should they occur, prior to the implementation of new revenue streams associated with parking services. Staff will address this as part of the work to develop 2013 Budget Directions, since it appears likely operating revenues next year will not be sufficient to fund 100% of the operation's costs.

**i) Updated Long Range Financial Plan**

Appendix "B" depicts the updated Long Range Financial Plan (LFRP) to include the amendments made by members of General Committee (illustrated by the red line in Appendix "B"). Staff have also provided projections in the LFRP, should Council decide to allocate all proceeds of parking lot land sales to the Parking Reserve, and the closure of 3 lots in the winter months (illustrated by the green line in Appendix "B").

Based on the growth data provided by Genivar, and the projected development of the lots, the City's parking supply will be adequate to 2031. However, shortly after 2031 the City will likely need to invest in another parking structure to meet the parking demand. There will be the potential of debt financing another parking structure in the event there is not a healthy balance in the Parking Reserve.

If there are any questions, please contact Brent Forsyth at extension 4521, or e-mail at [bforsyth@barrie.ca](mailto:bforsyth@barrie.ca).

*B. Forsyth*

B. Forsyth  
Performance Analyst

*R. W. McArthur*

R. W. McArthur, P. Eng.  
Director of Engineering

**APPENDIX "A"**

**2011 PARKING REVENUE - COST SUMMARY**

Location		Occupancy						Revenue			Operating Costs					Development Potential			
Parking Lot Name	Sq M	# Stalls	PDM/Meter	Date	Ave %	Date	Ave %	2011 Meters	2011 P&D	2011 Permits	Rev. Total	Maint.	Collection	Surfaces	Corp OH	Debt	TOTAL	Ranking	Year
Market Square Lot	2713	96	2	May/Sept	55	Dec 6-8	80		\$19,080.00	\$32,815.20	\$52,795.20	\$8,258.00	\$3,182.00	\$14,941.25	\$8,021.39		\$34,400.64	10	2012
City Hall Lot	2051	59	1	May/Sept	68	Dec 6-8	88		\$19,410.00		\$19,410.00	\$5,664.00	\$2,183.00	\$10,326.25	\$5,503.04		\$23,676.29	1	n/a
Owen Street Lot	1500	43	1	May/Sept	69	Dec 6-8	93		\$9,112.75	\$20,695.95	\$29,808.70	\$4,128.00	\$1,591.00	\$9,426.25	\$4,010.69		\$18,155.94	7	2021
Library Lot	1872	65	1	May/Sept	60	Dec 6-8	64		\$41,427.50	\$15,351.05	\$56,778.55	\$6,240.00	\$2,405.00	\$10,356.25	\$6,062.08		\$25,063.93	3	2031+
H-Block	5341	174	2	May/Sept	62	Dec 6-8	49		\$13,888.50	\$31,945.10	\$45,833.60	\$16,704.00	\$8,438.00	\$21,291.88	\$16,229.32		\$60,663.20	7	2021
Claperton Street Lot	957	30	1	May/Sept	76	Dec 6-8	91		\$10,500.00	\$33,436.70	\$43,936.70	\$5,280.00	\$2,035.00	\$8,521.25	\$2,798.18		\$18,634.41	10	2014
Claperton Street Lot (gravel)	622	25		May/Sept	incl above	Dec 6-8	incl above							\$4,280.03	\$2,331.80		\$6,612.43	10	2014
Maple & Ross Lot 3	1440	44	1	May/Sept	14	Dec 6-8	27		\$4,866.00	\$1,740.20	\$6,606.20	\$4,224.00	\$1,628.00	\$9,016.25	\$4,103.97		\$18,972.22	7	2021
Maple Street Lot 2	1069	34	1	May/Sept	36	Dec 6-8	38		\$5,925.00	\$2,858.90	\$8,783.90	\$3,204.00	\$1,258.00	\$8,481.25	\$3,171.25		\$16,174.50	7	2021
Maple & Dunlop Lot 1	687	27	1	May/Sept	38	Dec 6-8	44		\$7,678.00	\$2,361.70	\$10,039.70	\$2,582.00	\$999.00	\$8,026.25	\$2,518.34		\$14,135.59	7	2021
Bayfield & Maple Lot	910	25	2	May/Sept	54	Dec 6-8	82		\$8,200.00	\$2,550.20	\$10,750.20	\$2,400.00	\$925.00	\$7,826.25	\$2,331.80		\$13,483.05	Not Owned	n/a
Bayfield Street Lot	2507	81	2	May/Sept	47	Dec 6-8	30		\$21,225.40	\$22,560.45	\$43,785.85	\$7,778.00	\$2,997.00	\$11,536.25	\$7,555.03		\$29,864.28	10	2014
Mary Street Lot	806	27	21	May/Sept	26	Dec 6-8	74	\$11,523.42	\$2,050.95	\$2,050.95	\$2,050.95	\$2,990.00	\$990.00	\$8,206.25	\$2,518.34		\$14,315.59	7	2021
Spint Catcher Lot	2364	75	1	May/Sept	19	Dec 6-8	24		\$12,796.25	\$3,418.25	\$16,214.50	\$7,200.00	\$2,775.00	\$14,756.88	\$8,995.40		\$31,727.28	1	n/a
North Marina Lot (gravel)	1810	50	2	May/Sept	38	Dec 6-8	4		\$2,186.75	\$4,907.20	\$2,683.95	\$4,800.00	\$1,850.00	\$10,771.25	\$4,663.60		\$22,084.85	1	n/a
Bradford Street Lot	520	56	1	May/Sept	28	Dec 6-8	32		\$18,522.00	\$559.35	\$19,081.35	\$5,376.00	\$2,072.00	\$15,451.25	\$5,223.23		\$28,122.48	1	n/a
Lakeshore Lot (gravel)	836	17	1	May/Sept	14	Dec 6-8	32		\$1,950.75	\$1,372.00	\$1,950.75	\$1,632.00	\$629.00	\$4,890.63	\$1,585.62		\$8,707.25	7	2021
15 Bayfield Street Lot (gravel)	1353	45	1	May/Sept	0	Dec 6-8	14		\$543.25	\$1,107.40	\$1,650.65	\$4,320.00	\$1,666.00	\$4,890.63	\$1,585.62		\$18,823.87	10	2014
Simcoe Street East Lot	2822	90	2	May/Sept	44	Dec 6-8	81		\$49,582.25	\$19,933.20	\$69,515.45	\$8,640.00	\$3,300.00	\$16,111.88	\$8,394.47		\$35,476.35	10	2014
Heritage Park Lot West	3272	58	1	May/Sept	13	Dec 6-8	11		\$16,857.50	\$1,861.10	\$18,718.60	\$5,568.00	\$2,148.00	\$10,331.25	\$5,409.77		\$23,455.02	3	2031+
Heritage Park Lot East		22	1	May/Sept	45	Dec 6-8	20		\$7,654.45		\$7,654.45	\$2,112.00	\$814.00	\$5,000.63	\$2,051.98		\$9,978.61	3	2031+
Heritage Park at Hooters		8	1	May/Sept	50	Dec 6-8	41		\$8,382.27		\$8,382.27	\$768.00	\$296.00	\$4,630.63	\$746.18		\$8,440.81	3	2031+
Lakeshore Mews	1542	36	2	May/Sept	89	Dec 6-8	94		\$10,124.80	\$20,928.30	\$31,053.10	\$3,456.00	\$1,332.00	\$8,286.25	\$3,357.79		\$16,432.04	2	n/a
Mulcaster Street Lot	775	27	1	May/Sept	55	Dec 6-8	63		\$12,636.00	\$6,169.80	\$18,805.80	\$2,592.00	\$999.00	\$8,386.25	\$2,518.34		\$14,495.59	7	2021
Georgian Fields - Permit Lot		101		May/Sept	15	Dec 6-8	5		\$3,435.20		\$3,435.20	\$9,698.00	\$3,737.00	\$18,237.50	\$9,420.47		\$41,090.97	Not Owned	n/a
Collier Laneway - Permit Lot		15		May/Sept	19	Dec 6-8	105		\$3,480.40		\$3,480.40	\$1,440.00	\$655.00	\$8,886.25	\$1,399.08		\$10,280.33	10	2014

  

Parking Lot Name	Sq M	Stalls	# Machines	Date	%	Date	% AM/PM	2011 Meters	2011 P&D	2011 Permit	Rev. Total	Meter	Collection	Facility Ops	Corp OH	Debt	TOTAL	Ranking	Year
Collier Parkade	1153	303		May/Sept	42	Dec 6-8	34		\$73,963.33	\$104,253.80	\$178,247.13	\$29,088.00	\$11,211.00	\$212,157.00	\$28,261.40	\$964,893	\$1,245,612.12		
TD bank									\$8,400.00		\$8,400.00								

  

Parking Lot Name	Sq M	Stalls	# Machines	Date	%	Date	% AM/PM	2011 Meters	2011 P&D	2011 Permit	Rev. Total	Meter	Collection	Surfaces	Corp OH	Debt	TOTAL	Ranking	Year
Gowan (Essa to William)	52	0												\$15,000.00	\$4,850.14		\$0.00		
Gowan (William to Bayview)	85	0												\$20,000.00	\$7,928.11		\$0.00		
Gowan (Bayview to Milburn)	50	0												\$15,000.00	\$4,663.60		\$0.00		
Essa	2	2						\$77.36			\$77.36	\$192.00	\$74.00	\$114.45	\$186.54		\$566.99		
Cumberland	13	13						\$2,896.01			\$2,896.01	\$1,248.00	\$481.00	\$1,227.89	\$1,212.54		\$4,169.43		
Parkside	63	1		May/Sept	21	Dec 6-8	37		\$623.75	\$10.75	\$634.50	\$6,048.00	\$2,331.00	\$2,078.99	\$5,876.13		\$16,334.12		
Parkside (Sophia W to Ross)	0	2						\$6,705.50			\$6,705.50			\$18.99	\$0.00		\$818.99		
Ross (Parkside to Toronto)	20	20						\$4,429.60			\$4,429.60	\$1,920.00	\$740.00	\$1,442.35	\$1,865.44		\$5,067.79		
Toronto	18	2						\$2,182.00		\$83.65	\$2,265.65	\$1,728.00	\$680.00	\$1,142.35	\$1,078.89		\$5,209.24		
Dunlop W (Toronto to Mary)	8	8						\$3,290.56			\$3,290.56	\$788.00	\$266.00	\$755.63	\$746.18		\$2,565.81		
Dunlop W (Mary to Maple)	14	14						\$13,907.71			\$13,907.71	\$1,344.00	\$518.00	\$1,024.53	\$1,305.81		\$4,192.34		
Dunlop W (Maple to Bayfield)	13	13						\$12,108.32			\$12,108.32	\$1,248.00	\$481.00	\$1,004.53	\$1,212.54		\$3,946.07		
Mary (Simcoe to Dunlop)	5	5						\$1,950.90			\$1,950.90	\$480.00	\$185.00	\$546.72	\$466.36		\$1,678.08		
Mary (Dunlop to Ross)	21	21						\$9,031.07			\$9,031.07	\$2,037.00	\$777.00	\$2,281.33	\$1,956.71		\$7,054.04		
Maple (Simcoe to Dunlop)	13	13						\$7,194.48			\$7,194.48	\$1,248.00	\$481.00	\$1,163.44	\$1,212.54		\$4,094.98		
Maple (Dunlop to Ross)	12	12						\$8,556.22			\$8,556.22	\$1,152.00	\$444.00	\$1,358.80	\$1,119.26		\$4,072.06		
Bayfield (Simcoe to Dunlop)	51	2						\$4,474.50			\$4,474.50	\$4,896.00	\$1,887.00	\$2,485.71	\$4,756.87		\$14,025.58		
Bayfield (Dunlop to Collier)	0	4						\$11,788.75			\$11,788.75			\$1,265.81	\$0.00		\$1,265.81		
Bayfield (Collier to Worsley)	5	5						\$700.16			\$700.16	\$480.00	\$185.00	\$844.53	\$466.36		\$1,975.89		
Claperton (Dunlop to Collier)	27	27						\$28,028.04			\$28,028.04	\$2,562.00	\$999.00	\$1,582.35	\$2,518.34		\$7,091.69		
Claperton (Collier to Worsley)	9	9						\$6,782.15			\$6,782.15	\$864.00	\$333.00	\$1,222.35	\$839.45		\$3,258.90		
Claperton (Worsley to McDonald)	17	17						\$2,485.20			\$2,485.20	\$1,632.00	\$629.00	\$1,880.18	\$1,585.02		\$5,528.78		
Dunlop E (Bayfield to Fred Grant)	21	21						\$31,553.61			\$31,553.61	\$2,016.00	\$777.00	\$1,909.07	\$1,958.71		\$36,060.74		
Dunlop E (Fred Grant to Owen)	5	5						\$8,652.96			\$8,652.96	\$1,824.00	\$333.00	\$323.36	\$466.36		\$2,946.72		
Dunlop E (Fred Grant to Simcoe)	6													\$343.38	\$559.63		\$902.99		
Old Simcoe St.	19	19						\$23,743.14			\$23,743.14	\$1,824.00	\$703.00	\$1,124.53	\$1,772.17		\$5,423.70		
Dunlop E (Mulcaster to Poyntz)	29	29						\$23,556.36			\$23,556.36	\$2,784.00	\$1,073.00	\$2,368.88	\$2,704.89		\$8,928.77		
Dunlop E (Poyntz to Sampson)	35	35						\$4,747.46			\$4,747.46	\$3,360.00	\$1,295.00	\$2,933.60	\$3,264.52		\$10,853.12		
Collier (Bayfield to Claperton)	14	14						\$10,381.47			\$10,381.47	\$1,344.00	\$518.00	\$1,024.53	\$1,305.81		\$4,192.34		
Collier (Claperton to Owen)	35	6						\$34,796.25			\$34,796.25	\$3,360.00	\$1,295.00	\$3,753.60	\$3,284.52		\$11,673.12		
Collier (Owen to Mulcaster)	30	30						\$39,937.74			\$39,937.74	\$2,880.00	\$1,100.00	\$2,536.79	\$2,798.18		\$9,323.95		
Collier (Mulcaster to Poyntz)	28	4						\$15,201.00			\$15,201.00	\$2							

**APPENDIX "B"**

