

Page: 1 File: Pending #: P87/08, P70/09, P44/10

TO:

GENERAL COMMITTEE

SUBJECT:

Police Accommodation

PREPARED BY AND KEY D. Burton, Manager of Facility Planning & Development, ext. 4352

D Burton Monan

CONTACT:

SUBMITTED BY:

B. Roth, Director of Leisure, Transit & Facilities

COMMISSIONER APPROVAL:

J. Sales, General Manager of Community Operations

CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER APPROVAL:

JON M. BABULIC, CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

RECOMMENDED MOTION

 That facility models A through F, as described in Appendix B of Staff Report LTF007-11, previously considered for facility accommodation of the Barrie Police Services, be eliminated from further consideration.

- 2. That the concept of a single centralized facility to accommodate the Barrie Police Service's future facility needs be adopted.
- 3. That in order to achieve the concept of a single centralized facility in a timely and cost effective manner, a three phased development strategy be implemented in accordance with Appendix "C" of Staff Report LTF007-11.
- 4. That staff be authorized to spend an amount not to exceed \$400,000 from the approved capital project "Police Services (79 Bell Farm)" to complete interim renovations at 29 Sperling Drive, 60 Bell Farm Road and 79 Bell Farm Road in 2011 at a cost not to exceed \$400,000 and that the funding source be changed from debt financing to the Tax Capital Reserve (Account #13-04-0440).
- 5. That staff be authorized in accordance with Purchasing By-Law 2008-121 to award a single source contract to Rebanks, Pepper, Littlewood in an amount not to exceed \$75,000 for the provision of consulting services to design facility footprints to assist in the research of property available that would meet the minimal to optimal land size required to construct a new centralized facility to accommodate the Barrie Police Service, and that such work be funded from the carryover funding available in the approved capital project "Police Services (79 Bell Farm)".
- 6. That staff report back at the earliest opportunity, on the full financial plan for the future accommodation of the Barrie Police Service and the impact it has on the 2011-2014 Capital Plan.

PURPOSE & BACKGROUND

- 7. The purpose of this report is to:
 - a. Provide a summary to General Committee of the information related to the investigation and options reviewed since 2008 to provide new facilities for the Barrie Police Service.

The City of BARRIE

STAFF REPORT LTF007-11 April 11, 2011

Page: 2 File: Pending #: P87/08, P70/09, P44/10

- Seek Council's adoption of a single facility concept centrally located in the community for the future delivery of police services.
- c. Seek spending approval to implement phase one of a new development strategy for interim renovations at 29 Sperling Drive, 60 Bell Farm Road and 79 Bell Farm Road in 2011.
- d. Seek spending approval to single source consulting services to develop facility "footprints" to assist in the research of land availability to accommodate such a facility.
- 8. In 2008 the Barrie Police Service Board identified new facilities would be required to address the future delivery of police services to the community given the community's growth. They are currently housed in two locations 29 Sperling Drive (City owned) and 60 Bell Farm Road (leased space).
- 9. As a result a creation of models from "A" to the most recent Model "F" have been reviewed, and documented, in an attempt to meet the two following optimum outcomes;
 - a. A single station located within the central geographic area of the City of Barrie in an effort to create operational efficiencies and meet space requirements for the next 20yrs.
 - b. A financially responsible solution that meets the space needs of the Police Service.
- 10. In August of 2008 the Barrie Police Service presented to City Council an accommodation review study prepared by CS&P which identified 10 key elemental areas which were most in need of expansion as well as identifying the space requirements for both immediate needs and forecasted needs to 2030. The recommendations presented in that report outlined models "A" to "D" ranging from maintain status quo, to a single 130,000 sqft. single facility. The recommendation made by CS&P was to construct a single stand alone facility.
- 11. Council directed staff to review alternatives to a single new facility as the cost associated with a new build was at the time upwards of \$45Million. Staff then completed a review and presented Models "E1" to "E3" for consideration. Council directed staff to proceed with the purchase of 79 Bell Farm Road pending positive outcomes of several due diligence reports. One report to be completed was a feasibility study prepared by Rebanks, Pepper, Littlewood to determine the feasibility of converting 79 Bell Farm Road to a property and evidence storage facility along with training including an 8 lane firing range. The outcome of that report resulted in a recommendation from the consultant stating this alternative was achievable.
- 12. City staff then continued with Rebanks, Pepper, Littlewood to prepare a full feasibility review of Model "E3" in consultation with Barrie Police Service. The results of this report identify that Model "E3" would provide significant savings compared to the single facility, however, it would be difficult to implement, although not impossible, and would force Barrie Police Service to operate in a decentralized model which is not considered optimal for operational efficiencies by the Barrie Police Service.
- 13. In 2010 Council approved the purchase of 35 Sperling Drive, a vacant lot, to address immediate parking needs and potentially provide an opportunity for building expansion to 29 Sperling Drive. A summary of existing properties for the Barrie Police Service is provided as Appendix "A".
- 14. In August 2010 City Council requested staff to complete a feasibility review of converting a 310,000 sqft warehouse located at 200 Fairview Road (former BEMIS plant) into a single police facility with the balance of the space to be available for other City use yet to be determined. This study has not been finalized but the draft submission indicates that the cost associated with this



Page: 3 File: Pending #: P87/08, P70/09, P44/10

option now called model "F" would be approximately \$50 Million in 2010 dollars, which is above the single new facility cost.

- 15. A summary of models A to F is provided as Appendix "B".
- 16. Since early 2011, City staff have met on a number of occasions with the Barrie Police Service Board and Police Chief Mark Neelin, to review their needs for future facility accommodation that would be the most effective means of delivering police services to the community.
- Subsequently, staff put forward a proposal to Barrie Police Service Board that would:
 - a) Provide for interim accommodations utilizing current facilities at 29 Sperling Drive, 60 Bell Farm Road and 79 Bell Farm Road. Renovations to be undertaken and completed during 2011.
 - b) Provide for a permanent single facility in a centralized location that could be constructed in two phases of 80,000sq.ft initially and a second phase of 70,000sq.ft when growth warrants it.

ANALYSIS

CONCEPTUAL ACCOMMODATION PLAN

- 18. In an effort to meet the two objectives outlined above, City staff met with Barrie Police Service to discuss a proposed phased implementation strategy which will see both sides working together to achieve both immediate and long term needs.
- 19. The Barrie Police Service is currently experiencing a significant space deficiency within its two facility locations at 29 Sperling Drive and 60 Bell Farm Road.
- 20. City staff prepared a conceptual phased accommodation plan for the Board's review, concurrence, and support prior to presenting this Staff Report to close off all preceding models and seek direction to proceed with the implementation of the phased accommodation plan.
- The phased plan is broken down with the following three phases;
 - a. Interim solution, renovations to 79 Bell Farm Road for property and evidence storage along with stores (currently at both 60 Bell Farm and 29 Sperling), renovations to 60 Bell Farm Road to create administrative space in previous stores area, and renovations to vacated spaces at 29 Sperling Drive for proposed use. Conceptual footprints developed and land investigation undertaken.
 - b. Purchase land within a central geographic region within Barrie sized large enough to accommodate a future 150,000 sqft. facility including indoor and outdoor parking needs. Construct an approximately 80,000 sqft. facility with planned expansion and adequate servicing. Removing the need for leased space at 60 Bell Farm Road, and the need for 79 Bell Farm Road, thus operating out of two stations. (Retention of 29 Sperling for use is proposed until approximately 2022 to maximize the building's useful lifecycle).
 - c. Expand the new facility from 80,000 sqft. to 150,000 sqft. to meet the projected 20yr need at the time expansion is warranted thus bringing the police service to the optimum service delivery model of a single new facility within the City's central geographic area.

The City of BARRIE

STAFF REPORT LTF007-11 April 11, 2011

Page: 4 File: Pending #: P87/08, P70/09, P44/10

- 22. Assumptions made relate to the groups which would be relocated in the interim phase, the initial size of the second station, and the timelines associated with the conceptual plan.
- 23. Appendix "C" outlines a high level timeline that would be associated with the implementation of this strategy. In addition to seeking support from the Police Services Board to proceed with the phased implementation approach their support was sought on the proposed initial timelines.
- 24. The Barrie Police Service Board and Chief Neelin have indicated to staff their support of the proposed concept for a single facility centrally located to be achieved by a three phase development strategy.
- 25. In addition, the City's Growth Management Study will incorporate the impact of growth on City services including services provided by partners such as the Barrie Police Service.

DEVELOPMENT RECOMMENDATIONS

- 26. Prior to any further work occurring on this matter, staff is seeking direction on the model for facility accommodation to meet the Barrie Police Service's current and future space accommodation needs. City staff cannot proceed any further in a review of potential design options or research suitable properties until a model is selected.
- 27. After considerable discussion, reviews, and investigations it is recommended that the model best able to meet all of the identified needs and provide the optimal operational efficiencies for the Barrie Police Service is the model of a single facility in a centrally located area.
- 28. In order to achieve the recommended outcome in a timely and cost effective manner, it is recommended that a three phased development strategy be implemented as outlined in Appendix "C" of this report.
- 29. If these recommendations are adopted by General Committee, then it would follow suit that no additional staff time be allocated to work associated with previous facility models A through F as outlined in Appendix "B" of this report.
- 30. City staff is cognizant of the need to consider both a cost effective means of providing City facilities and the City's intensification efforts in building a complete community for the future. As such, staff wish to consider the option of building "up" rather than "out" which would reduce the land size required for a future single facility.
- 31. To test this approach staff is recommending engaging consulting services to prepare facility footprints that would provide for the minimal to optimal land size required. This would then assist staff to investigate potential available sites and report back on their findings. Staff estimate that such consulting services would not exceed \$75,000.
- 32. Interim renovations at current Police facilities as outlined in Appendix "C" can be carried out in 2011 in a cost effective manner.

ENVIRONMENTAL MATTERS

33. There are no environmental impacts related to the recommended motions.



Page: 5 File: Pending #: P87/08, P70/09, P44/10

ALTERNATIVES

34. There are three alternatives available for consideration by General Committee:

Alternative #1

General Committee could choose to keep models A to F for further consideration. This alternative is not recommended as these models do not provide for a single facility centrally located that best meets the future facility accommodation needs of the Barrie Police Service in an operationally efficient manner with a phased implementation strategy.

Alternative #2

General Committee could choose to proceed with model E utilizing the current properties owned and leased by the City of Barrie for the provision of police service. Although this model provides facilities to meet the BPS needs until 2030 at the least expensive capital cost, this alternative is not recommended as it does not provide for a centrally located single facility and the inherent operational efficiencies associated with such a facility.

Alternative #3

General Committee could choose to remain status quo and not provide any additional facility space for the delivery of police services in Barrie. This alternative is not recommended as it does not address the significant demands for police services in a growing community and the necessary facility space to meet their existing needs nor their future needs.

FINANCIAL

- 35. The 2011-2020 Capital Plan includes funds for Barrie Police Service space accommodation in the amount of \$31.6M as noted in Appendix "D". The high level revised cost estimate to acquire land, design and construct an 80,000 sqft. facility in 2011 dollars is \$38.8M to \$41.3M.
- 36. This report is seeking spending approval from the approved capital project "Police Services (79 Bell Farm)" in 2011 for the following activities in Phase 1 only:
 - a. Interim renovations estimated at \$400,000 to be completed at 29 Sperling Drive, 60 Bell Farm Road and 79 Bell Farm Road.
 - b. Consulting services to an upset limit of \$75,000 to design facility footprints to assist in the research of property available that would meet the minimal to optimal land size required to construct a new centralized facility to accommodate the Barrie Police Service.
- 37. The 2011-2020 Capital Plan includes funds for "Police Services (79 Bell Farm)" for space accommodation in the amount of \$1.8M for 2011. The intent of that project was to convert 79 Bell Farm Road into administrative space and an indoor gun range. It was to be funded using debt financing as it formed one element of the broader multiple facility concept designed to meet the current and future needs of the Barrie Police Services.
- 38. Since staff are now proposing to undertake minimal renovations at 79 Bell Farm Road, which would forgo the indoor gun range (to be incorporated into the proposed new facility when it is built), it is recommended that \$400,000 for the interim renovations be funded from the Tax Capital Reserve account 13-04-0440 rather than issuing debt. The estimated cost associated with each location is \$175,000 for 79 Bell Farm Road, \$75,000 for 60 Bell Farm Road and \$150,000 for 29 Sperling Drive.

The City of BARRIE

STAFF REPORT LTF007-11 April 11, 2011

Page: 6 File: Pending #: P87/08, P70/09, P44/10

- 39. The "Police Services (79 Bell Farm)" project also has 2010 carry forward funds in the amount of \$101,000 for police accommodation that staff are proposing to use to fund the consulting services engagement for the new proposed facility estimated at up to \$75,000. These funds were originally funded from the Tax Capital Reserve account 13-04-0440.
- 40. A single source contract is being recommended to engage Rebanks, Pepper, Littlewood as they had previously been engaged by the City to conduct the feasibility reviews and costing of model E (three facilities in north end) and model F (conversion of former BEMIS plant) and are therefore completely familiar with all aspects of the identified needs for police accommodation and investigations to date. It is recommended to maximize this distinct knowledge base in the most cost effective manner, that staff be authorized to single source Rebanks, Pepper, Littlewood in accordance with the Purchasing By-Law 2008-121 as it permits single sourcing when it is clearly in the interest of the Corporation to do so.
- 41. Staff will report back to General Committee with recommendations on the overall project costs, related financial information including changes to the 2011-2014 Capital Plan, interim renovations status and land size and availability at the earliest opportunity.

LINKAGE TO 2010-2014 COUNCIL STRATEGIC PLAN

The recommendation(s) included in this Staff Report support the following goals identified in the 2010-2014 City Council Strategic Plan:

- Manage Growth and Protect the Environment
- Strengthen Barrie's Financial Condition
- 42. In order to meet the policing demands of a growing community expanded police accommodation facilities are required. The recommendation of a three phase implementation strategy towards the provision of a single facility, centrally located, represents a long range plan that reflects changes in the community's growth in a cost effective manner that is operationally efficient. It enables the Corporation to take full advantage of the building life cycle for 29 Sperling Drive, minimizes renovations costs to provide suitable interim accommodations to meet the immediate needs, while planning for the future.



STAFF REPORT LTF007-11

April 11, 2011 Appendix A Page: 7 File: Pending #: P87/08, P70/09, P44/10

EXISTING FACILITIES AND PROPERTY FOR BARRIE POLICE SERVICE

PROPERTY	OWNERSHIP & PURPOSE	COST TO PURCHASE/LEASE & USE STATUS	SQUARE FOOTAGE
29 Sperling Drive	City of Barrie	\$6.7 M	50,000
	Constructed in 1993 as the Barrie Police Service Head Quarters.		
60 Bell Farm Road	Leased from private owner since 2003. Expires 2013.	\$420,000 in initial leasehold improvements by City.	33,000
	To provide space for specialized tactical & emergency response vehicles, property unit & quartermaster stores, training space and a community policing division.	Additional expenditures by landlord and BPS for secured parking, communications and security equipment.	
	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	Annual lease and facility operating costs \$340,000.	
79 Bell Farm Road	City of Barrie	\$1.35M	25,000
	Purchased in 2010 for conversion into property and evidence storage and indoor gun range.	Currently vacant pending outcome of model F (BEMIS) property investigation.	
			Total of 3 Facilities 108,000
35 Sperling Drive	City of Barrie	\$515,000	Not Applicable
	Purchased lot in 2010 to provide additional parking for police headquarters and potential for future expansion if deemed desirable.	Being used by BPS for additional parking for police headquarters.	

Appendix B

Page: 8 File: Pending #: P87/08, P70/09, P44/10

SUMMARY OF MODELS A TO F CONSIDERED FOR POLICE FACILITY ACCOMMODATION NEEDS

MODEL	DESCRIPTION	RECOMMENDATION	SQUARE FOOTAGE	COST
A	Status Quo of 29 Sperling and leasing of 60 Bell Farm Road. (2 facilities in north)	Not a Feasible Outcome to Meet Needs.	83,000	Not Applicable
В	Renovations and Expansion of 29 Sperling. Termination of 60 BF Rd. lease. (1 larger facility in north)	Adequate Expansion Not Feasible. Not Recommended as a Viable Option for Long Term Needs.	75,180	\$25.6-\$29.6M (2008 dollars)
С	Maintain 29 Sperling and add a 2 nd New Facility (90,000 sqft) in south Barrie. (2 facilities, 1 north + 1 south)	No Advantages to Operating Out of Two Facilities, Significant Disadvantages Noted – Less Efficient Staff Operations, Duplication of Building Functions & Increased Operational Costs	140,000	\$36.1M (2008 dollars)
D	New Single Facility Centrally Located	Recommended by Consultant to Achieve Long Term Needs in an Operationally Efficient Manner.	130,000	\$45.3M (2008 dollars)
E	Expand 29 Sperling Dr. & keep 60 Bell Farm Rd. lease (20 years) and add 79 Bell Farm Rd. (3 facilities in north)	LTF Presented to Council in 2009 as Least Expensive Option While Recognizing Disadvantages as Noted in Option C	130,000	\$24.1M (2009 dollars)
F	Conversion of BEMIS plant into centrally located single facility	Significantly Oversized and Costs to Convert Exceed Development of a New Single Facility	310,000	\$50M (2010 dollars)



STAFF REPORT LTF007-11

April 11, 2011 Appendix C

Page: 9 File: Pending #: P87/08, P70/09, P44/10

SINGLE FACILITY CENTRALLY LOCATED MODEL UTILIZING A THREE PHASE DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY

PHASE	ACTIONS TO BE TAKEN	COST ESTIMATES
Phase I (2011)	 Interim renovations to 79 Bell Farm Road in 2011 in order to accommodate property and evidence storage along with stores component which currently resides in both 60 Bell Farm Road and 29 Sperling Drive. Renovations to 60 Bell Farm to create administrative space in previous stores area. Renovations to 29 Sperling as required. Develop footprints for new single facility and investigate land availability 	Interim renovations cost estimate \$400,000 for 29 Sperling Dr., 60 Bell Farm Rd. & 79 Bell Farm Road. * \$75,000
Phase II (2012- 2014)	 Purchase of land required to accommodate an ultimate single facility build. Maintain 29 Sperling Drive facility and construct a new 80,000 square foot facility to house key deficient areas. Exact division of requirements between new location and 29 Sperling to be determined through the planning process. Sell or repurpose for other City use the existing asset at 79 Bell Farm Road once construction of Phase II is complete. End the lease at 60 Bell Farm Road once construction is complete 	 Land acquisition cost to be determined based on property size and location (costs for land included in project estimate below). Estimated at \$38.8- \$41.3 depending on footprint versus land costs.
Phase III (2020- 2022)	 Complete a space needs assessment to identify needs for growth and total space requirements for Police Construct the required addition to the 80,000 square foot facility to accommodate both the total space currently occupied in 29 Sperling Drive and total project space deficiency identified to accommodate growth. Sell or repurpose for other City use the existing asset at 29 Sperling Drive once construction of Phase III is complete. 	Cost will depend on ultimate space needs determined from space needs assessment and timing of project.

STAFF REPORT LTF007-11

April 11, 2011 Appendix D Page: 10 File: Pending #: P87/08, P70/09, P44/10

POLICE ACCOMMODATION PROJECT 2011 – 2020 CAPITAL PLAN

YEAR	REQUEST	DC	DEBENTURE
2011	1,800,000		1,800,000
2012	6,700,000	930,263	5,769,737
2013	11,100,000	5,592,652	5,507,348
2014	5,650,000	1,605,812	4,044,188
2015	4,550,000		4,550,000
2016	1,800,000		1,800,000
TOTALS	31,600,000	8,128,727	23,471,273