



Engine 1531

Presentation to Heritage Barrie
From Economic & Creative Development



Engine 1531 – Presentation Purpose

To review the following matter with Heritage Barrie as directed by Council Motion 21-G-218 on September 13th, 2021.

That Economic and Creative Development Staff consult with the Heritage Barrie Committee regarding the restoration and Donation of Historic Train - Engine 1531 to the County of Simcoe and the associated preliminary cost benefit analysis for locating Engine 1531 at the Allandale Station or in the vicinity of the Southshore Centre versus the County of Simcoe Museum.

Engine 1531 – Project Overview

- In 2010 Engine 1531 was moved from Barrie's waterfront to the Simcoe County Museum
- The cost at that time to move the engine, lay track at the Museum, and perform hazardous material abatement was \$149,000
- The restoration of Engine 1531 remains incomplete.
- Council Motion 17-G-289 (2017) directed Staff to enter exploratory negotiations with the Simcoe County Museum for a potential donation
- The Museum have confirmed an interest in receiving Engine 1531 as a donation in order to ensure its long-term preservation and to continue to build on its collection focused on County's rich history in transportation, including the role of Allandale Station.

Current Status

- Engine 1531 has been at the Museum since 2010 and other than the asbestos abatement and minor paint work, there has not been any maintenance or restoration work completed on it
- The quote for restoration and preservation of the Engine, Tender and Caboose from the Simcoe County Museum is estimated at \$319,000, including a \$29,000 contingency
- This quote does not include project management, or the majority of the labour to complete the restoration as this would be completed by Simcoe County Museum staff and volunteers.



Relationship with Simcoe County Museum

- The City of Barrie has a long association with the Simcoe County Museum, beginning in 1928 when the original museum was in Barrie. It is estimated that 60% of the 35,000-45,000 annual visitors to the Simcoe County Museum are residents of Barrie
- More than 8,000 students visit their site annually for educational purposes
- Many of the exhibits that the Simcoe County Museum are connected to the City of Barrie, including Barrie's Main Street Exhibit.
- The display of Engine 1531 at the Simcoe County Museum currently fits with the Museum's theme of Barrie and Simcoe County in the early 20th century, covering the period of late 1800's to early 1900's
- The Simcoe County Museum continues to provide preventative care in the absence of the full restoration being completed.

Simcoe County Museum Considerations

- Staff reviewed Council Direction and alternatives with Simcoe County Museum staff. The Simcoe County Museum is currently managing priorities and its own opportunities related to its strategic planning. As such, a project of the magnitude of Engine 1531 and its restoration present several challenges for the Simcoe County Museum to continue to recommend supporting it as a temporary exhibit to County Council. Specifically:
- If Engine 1531 is to be temporary and relocated away from the Museum upon completion of the restoration, the Simcoe County Museum would not have the project management or labour resources to provide in-kind to support the three-year restoration program. As such, the City would be responsible for the additional costs of labour and project management to complete the restoration, beyond the \$319,000 investment.
- The Simcoe County Museum would not be in a position to support Engine 1531 being restored by an independent organization on the Museum site for several project and risk management requirements. As such, the Engine would need to be removed from the site for restoration to be completed, at the additional cost to the City.

Two Options

Restore Engine 1531 and Return to Allandale or Nearby Southshore

- Could return to Allandale when site is ready
- Would need to be transported from Museum in 2022 to another site for restoration then move again to site if Allandale/Southshore
- City would go out for RFQs for restoration work and project management
- Site requires potential investigations, preparation, concrete pad, permits, and protective measures
- No timeline for this work
- No dedicated human resources
- Estimated budget = \$600,000+

Donate Engine to Simcoe County Museum

- Engine would remain at Simcoe County Museum
- Museum has established a restoration work program and budget phased over three years
- Project management and much of labour for restoration work would be in-kind
- Museum site is secure and provides a holistic educational experience for visitors
- Opportunities to create experiences and signage at Allandale will tie the two sites and Engine's history together
- Estimated budget = \$319,000 over three years

Allandale Station or Southshore Park Locations

- Parks Planning Staff are currently undertaking an update to the City's Waterfront Master Plan – this update will address several areas around the waterfront, including Military Heritage Park and Southshore Park, which are in the vicinity of Allandale Station.
- Southshore Park is currently utilized to support Kempenfest and other events and the presence of Engine 1531 would occupy a significant portion of greenspace and impact the utilization of Southshore Park as open space.
- The Allandale Station site has not yet received clearance for development and consideration to the complete history of the site including Indigenous People's who first occupied the land, must be considered as part of the overall placement of artifacts on the Allandale Station site.

Heritage Tourism Impacts

- In consultation with colleagues in Tourism, additional consideration is needed in order to make the engine a valuable tourism asset
- To create a Heritage Tourism experience, it would need to be augmented with other products like guided tours or audio and storyboards, self-guided tours, or holograms with stories about Barrie's railroad history
- Ideally, there would have to be tie-ins to other surrounding attractions and events related to Engine 1531/trains, etc. in order for Allandale Station to be recognized as a destination to see or learn about the region's railroad history
- Additional considerations for investing in product development opportunities and events that would provide a tourism cluster of a group of activities within the geographical space that works as a system

Preliminary Cost-Benefit Analysis

- In absence of a heritage tourism strategy or plan for a locomotive tourism attraction at Allandale Station or on the waterfront, it is challenging for Staff to support a business case for the additional expenses associated with retaining Engine 1531
- In addition to the restoration and moving costs and the potential for temporary relocation, to consider the return to Barrie, costing associated with soil assessments, concrete slab, engineering, track installation, protection of the site, etc. becomes quite cost prohibitive
- A cursory look at granting programs, has not identified any significant funding sources

Staff Position

- Based upon the current status of the Allandale Station site, fiscal costs to move, maintain and preserve the engine, and the ability to add a fulsome educational experience at the Museum, the preferred recommendation is to donate Engine 1531 to the Simcoe County Museum
- Potential to redirect a small percentage of the additional budget needed to relocate the Engine to opportunities that leverage other Tourism funding to cultivate a regional tourism experience that encompasses programming and interpretive signage and unique product development between the Simcoe County Museum and at Allandale Station

Discussion Items

- Feedback from the Committee on Staff Analysis and Position
- Idea generation and exploration:
 - How might we consider options for recognizing/incorporating Barrie's rail history at Allandale Station beyond Engine 1531?