



**ECONOMIC AND CREATIVE
DEVELOPMENT
MEMORANDUM**

Page: 1
File:
Pending #:

TO: CITY BUILDING COMMITTEE

FROM: A. DYKE, CULTURE DEVELOPMENT OFFICER, X4593

**NOTED: S. SCHLICHTER, DIRECTOR, ECONOMIC AND CREATIVE DEVELOPMENT
B. ARANIYASUNDARAN, P.ENG, PMP, GENERAL MANAGER,
INFRASTRUCTURE AND GROWTH MANAGEMENT**

RE: RESTORATION AND DONATION OF HISTORIC TRAIN - ENGINE 1531

DATE: NOVEMBER 23, 2021

The purpose of this Memorandum is to provide members of the City Building Committee with information related to Historic Train, Engine 1531, as directed by Council Motion 21-G-218 on September 13th, 2021:

“That Staff Report ECD004-21 concerning the Restoration and Donation of Historic Train - Engine 1531 be referred back to staff in the Economic and Creative Development Department to provide further information concerning a cost benefit analysis for locating Engine 1531 at the Allandale Station or in the vicinity of the Southshore Centre versus the County of Simcoe Museum and to consult with the Heritage Barrie Committee and report back to General Committee prior to the 2023 Budget and Business Plan. ”.

Staff made a presentation to the Heriage Barrie Committee on Wednesday, November 10th, 2021, to provide information and analysis per Motion 21-G-218.

Heritage Barrie has put forth a recommendation to endorse the staff recommendation outlined in Staff Report ECD004-21, as follows:

- “1. That subject to the approval of the County of Simcoe, staff in the Economic and Creative Development Department be authorized to negotiate an agreement with the Simcoe County Museum for donation of Engine 1531, its tender box and its caboos (referred to as Engine 1531) that identifies the donation, to be included as part of the Museum’s larger exhibit regarding local railway heritage, with an emphasis on City of Barrie and the Allandale Station, subject to terms and conditions to the satisfaction of the Director of Economic and Creative Development and in a form to the satisfaction of the Director of Legal Services.
2. That the City Clerk be authorized to execute the donation agreement subject to the terms of the agreement being to the satisfaction of the Director of Finance/Treasurer and in a form to the satisfaction of the Director of Legal Services.
3. That funding in the amount of \$150,000, \$100,000, and \$64,000 be included in the Capital Budget request for the years 2022-2024 respectively, funded from the Reinvestment Reserve in order to complete the restoration work needed to restore Engine 1531 to a condition suitable for donation.

4. That staff in the Economic and Creative Development and Corporate Facilities Departments incorporate a program to include community displays for recognizing the railway as part of the City's heritage and as part of the City's restoration work at Allandale Station, in consultation with the Allandale Neighbourhood Association and Heritage Barrie and report back to General Committee with options and costs associated with the recognition program."

The project is currently budgeted in the 2022 Capital Budget as 'Project 001081 Engine 1531 Restoration for Donation to Simcoe County' and reflects the capital expenditures in years 2022-2024, as recommended in Staff Report ECD004-21.

Background and Analysis

Project Overview

In 2010, Engine 1531 was moved from Barrie's waterfront to the Simcoe County Museum. In 2017, Council Motion 17-G-289 directed Staff to enter exploratory negotiations with the Simcoe County Museum for a potential donation. The Museum have confirmed an interest in receiving Engine 1531 as a donation, in order to ensure its long-term preservation and to continue to build on its collection focused on County's rich history in transportation, including the role of Allandale Station.

Engine 1531 has been at the Museum since 2010, and other than the asbestos abatement and minor paint work, there has not been restoration work completed on it. Museum staff continue to provide preventative care in the absence of the full restoration being completed. The current quote for restoration and preservation of the Engine, Tender and Caboose from the Simcoe County Museum is estimated at \$319,000, including a \$29,000 contingency. This quote does not include project management, or the majority of the labour to complete the restoration as this would be completed by Simcoe County Museum staff and volunteers.

Simcoe County Museum Considerations

Staff reviewed Council Direction and alternatives with Simcoe County Museum staff. The Simcoe County Museum is currently managing priorities and its own opportunities related to its strategic planning. As such, a project of the magnitude of Engine 1531, and its restoration, present several challenges for the Simcoe County Museum to continue to recommend supporting it as a temporary exhibit to County Council. Specifically:

- a) If Engine 1531 is to be considered a temporary loan and relocated away from the Museum at a later date, the Simcoe County Museum would not have the project management or labour resources to provide in-kind to support the three-year restoration program. As such, the City would be responsible for the additional costs of labour and project management to complete the restoration, beyond the \$319,000 investment.
- b) The Simcoe County Museum would not be in a position to support Engine 1531 being restored by an independent organization on the Museum site for several project and risk management requirements. As such, the Engine would need to be removed from the site for restoration to be completed, at the additional cost to the City.



ECONOMIC AND CREATIVE DEVELOPMENT MEMORANDUM

Page: 3
File:
Pending #:

Comparison of Alternatives

Restore Engine 1531 and Return to Allandale or Nearby Southshore	Donate Engine to Simcoe County Museum
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Could return to Allandale or Southshore when site is ready. • Would need to be transported from Museum in 2022 to another site for restoration then move again to permanent site. • City would need to complete an independent procurement for the restoration work and project management. • Site requires potential soil investigations, preparation, concrete pad, permits, and protective measures. • There is no project or capital plan for this work or dedicated and available human resources. • Estimated budget = \$600,000+ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Engine would remain at Simcoe County Museum. • Museum has established a restoration work program and budget phased over three years. • Project management and much of labour for restoration work would be in-kind. • Museum site is secure and provides a holistic educational experience for visitors. • Opportunities to create heritage tourism experiences and signage at Allandale that would tie the two sites and Engine’s history together. • Estimated budget = \$319,000 over three years (includes \$29,000 contingency – project could come under this budget).

Consideration of Allandale Station and Southshore Park Locations

Parks Planning Staff are currently undertaking an update to the City’s Waterfront Master Plan. This update will address several areas around the waterfront, including Military Heritage Park and Southshore Park, which are in the vicinity of Allandale Station. Southshore Park is currently utilized to support Kempenfest and other events and the presence of Engine 1531 would occupy a significant portion of greenspace and impact the utilization of Southshore Park as open space and is not a preferred location.

Preliminary Cost-Benefit Analysis

In absence of a heritage tourism strategy or plan for a locomotive tourism attraction at Allandale Station or on the waterfront, it is challenging for Staff to support a business case for the additional expenses associated with retaining Engine 1531. In addition to the restoration and moving costs and the potential for temporary relocation, to consider the return to Barrie, expenses associated with soil assessments, concrete slab, engineering, track installation, protection of the site, etc. become quite cost prohibitive. A cursory look at granting programs to support such work has not identified any significant funding sources.



**ECONOMIC AND CREATIVE
DEVELOPMENT
MEMORANDUM**

Page: 4
File:
Pending #:

It is worth noting also that the Museum has indicated it is not their practice to accept donations of historical significance without accompanying monetary donations to support restoration, exhibition and maintenance.

Discussion of Recommendation with Heritage Barrie

Based upon the current status of the Allandale Station and Southshore sites, fiscal costs to move, maintain and preserve the engine, and the ability to add a fulsome educational experience at the Museum, the recommendation from Heritage Barrie is that the City complete the restoration and to donate Engine 1531 to the Simcoe County Museum, per Staff Report EDC004-21.

Opportunities exist to leverage tourism funding to cultivate a regional tourism experience that encompasses programming and interpretive signage and unique product development between the Simcoe County Museum and at Allandale Station. Staff will work with the Heritage Barrie committee to develop a plan for recognizing and incorporating Barrie's history at Allandale Station beyond Engine 1531.